Balancing Public Access and Security

GSX Session 4111

Scott Hogan, CD, PSP
Randall Romanin, AIBC, AAA, OAA, FRAIC
Balancing Public Access and Security

• Can public access and building perimeter security be compatible?

• The purpose of perimeter security is to deter access – which would seem to conflict with site accessibility.

• HOWEVER - that purpose has evolved so that security can be added in a non-aggressive way through landscaping and softer design elements.

• We will explore examples where security is integrated into the design stage to ensure that the solutions are compatible with the client’s objectives.
“Protection and security are only valuable if they do not cramp life excessively.” – Carl Yung

• Throughout history, architects, designers and builders have addressed security of all kinds.

• Doors, gates, fenestration and window grills - the most visible security components of a building - have been raised to the level of high art through architectural design.

• We shape our built environment to provide shelter from natural phenomena such as precipitation, temperature extremes and sun.

• Site and building design also encompasses the two distinct – yet closely related – issues of safety and security.
Safety vs Security

- **Site and building safety** issues deal with the natural and unintentional threats such as fires, earthquakes, hurricanes, floods and accidental spills.

- **Site and building security** issues are about the prevention and detection of intentional, humanly motivated threats such as criminal, terrorist and other malevolent acts directed towards buildings and their occupants.

- Sometimes designing for one can address the other:
  - EXAMPLE: redundancy for electrical power simultaneously addresses emergencies caused by a thunderstorm or terrorist attack.
CPTED

CPTED is a proactive design philosophy built around a core set of principles that is based on the belief that the proper design and effective use of the built environment can lead to a reduction in the fear and incidence of crime as well as an improvement in the quality of life.

Provides information for the protection of buildings and occupants from the site perimeters to the faces of buildings.
United Facilities Criteria (UFC)

UFC documents provide criteria for:

- Planning
- Design
- Construction
- Sustainment
- Restoration
- Modernization

Apply to the Military Departments, the Defense Agencies, and the DoD Field Activities in accordance with DoD Directive 4270.5 (Military Construction) and USD (AT&L) Memorandum dated 29 May 2002.
National Capital Planning Commission (NCPC)

• U.S. government agency providing planning guidance for Washington, D.C., and the surrounding National Capital Region.
• Many federal facilities and grounds in the nation’s capital had open and accessible designs.
• After the 1995 Oklahoma City bombing and the events of September 11, 2001, security needs were elevated and unsightly temporary solutions were often used to restrict access to public space.
• NCPC led early efforts to develop effective security approaches that also preserve the openness of Washington DC’s public spaces and enhance the civic realm.
“Departments must ensure that their physical security strategy incorporates identifiable elements of protection, detection, response and recovery”.
Who Makes Safety and Security Decisions?

- The safety aspects of buildings are addressed by Building Codes that establish minimum standards for the design of building systems and components.

- Decisions about site and building security are left to the discretion of building owners, their managers and operators.
Concentric Barriers

As outlined in FEMA 430:

- **FIRST LAYER of defense:** The neighbourhood and community surrounding the site.

- **SECOND LAYER of defense:** The space that exists between the defended perimeter and the assets that require protection.

- **THIRD LAYER of defense:** The protection of the asset itself.
First Layer Of Defense:

• Community influences every project.
• A TRA will consider threats and vulnerabilities both on and off the site.
• Off-site issues include:
  o Topography
  o Access to the site
  o Views to the site
  o Neighboring properties
Plaza Francia Sur, Caracas, Venezuela
Alterations to the existing surroundings can contribute to the first layer of defense:
Streetscape Elements suitable for hardening as security elements
PARLIAMENT HILL
Ottawa, ON
Parliament Hill
Parliamentary Precinct - Definition

“The premises which the House of Commons and Senate occupy from time to time for their corporate purposes. It includes those premises where each House through its Speaker exercises physical control to enable Members to perform their parliamentary work without obstruction or interference.”

Parliamentary Privilege

*Privilege* relates to Hill security in 3 ways

- Securing the Hill from threats and protecting Parliamentarians
- Assures Parliamentarians freedom from ALL TYPES of obstructions. Security cannot prevent access to the House or Senate or performing their parliamentary functions.
- Gives Parliament the exclusive freedom to regulate its own affairs. In Canada, Parliament’s authority over its own procedures is absolute.

“The denial of access to Members of the House – even if temporary – is unacceptable, and constitutes a contempt of the House. Members must not be impeded or interfered with while on their way to the Chamber, or when going about their parliamentary business. To permit this would interfere with the operation of the House of Commons, and undermine the pre-eminent right of the House to the service of its Members.”

Source: Anne Dance 2014
Parliament Hill – Use of the Hill Committee

• Committee established in 1942
• Limitations on signage, props, messaging, noise levels, hours of operation, etc.
• Flexible approach is key
• Events must be “safe, successful, and contribute positively to Canada’s democracy”

Dominion Day, 1 July 1927
Changing of the Guard Ceremony
9/11 Vigil, September 2001
Public Works Hill Cam – Yoga on Parliament Hill
“Rather than have ... a whole spectacle of confrontation, we try to facilitate and find balance for protesters while at the same time not disturbing the functions of Parliament.”

“When you’re dealing with these types of incidents there are many tools in the toolbox. The tool of last resort really is that enforcement tool. And when you bring that ... tool out, no one’s going to win, people are going to get hurt, it’s going to look bad, and ... it just doesn’t resolve the issues.”

“When people’s economic welfare is put in jeopardy, you’re going to get protests, and you’re going to get demonstrations.”

Source: Anne Dance 2014
Protests and Parliament Hill (Continued)

• “My instinct tells me that when everyone comes here, they are so in awe of the space that... [protests lack] the same ferocity”

• Hill protests are inevitable

• Protests might be managed and challenged by police, but they are still regarded as important to democracy.

• They are valued as an essential component of the Hill as a public space

Source: Anne Dance 2014
Labour Demonstration against wage controls, 1976
Women's March Against Poverty, 2000
Public Access and ...Construction
Parliament Hill – Wellington Wall (Precinct)
Wellington & Elgin Streets, Ottawa
Challenges / Pressures – Parliament Hill

Second Level Of Defense:

Walls, fences and revetments of various kinds have long served as the second line of defense for a specific site.
Some barriers just provide a separation without being overly robust.
Proceeding with knee-jerk reactions isn’t always the most sensible solution....
“Physical security has shifted from an overt militarized landscape of decades past to a more camouflaged landscape currently prevalent in cities.”

Jeremy Nemeth, University of Colorado

US Embassy, Ottawa, ON
Integrate Security Into Design: Caracas, Venezuela
Third Level Of Defense:

• The building envelope (walls, roofs and openings for doors and windows) primarily protects the building and its occupants from the natural elements.

• In a security context the building envelope is intended to keep enemies out, delay enemy penetration and/or buy response time.

• The most challenging task is to design an envelope that doesn’t leak and doesn’t admit the enemy, yet represents the building’s status architecturally.
Beirut, Lebanon
• Most experts agree that the need for physical security design will continue as long as there are conflicting social, religious and political agendas in the world.

• The integration of security objectives and fire/life safety objectives into building design requires early planning and collaboration.
QUESTIONS?

• Scott Hogan, CD, PSP
  Scott is the Chief, Security Requirements and Project Management Office with the Senate of Canada. He has worked for a number of private and public sector organizations.

• Randall Romanin, AIBC, AAA, OAA, FRAIC
  Randy is a Senior Architect and Security Specialist in the Security Consulting Group at Morrison Hershfield.